



BUYER'S GUIDE

FOR HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING

f e v tutor

A GUIDE TO SELECTING THE RIGHT
TUTORING SOLUTION

INTRODUCTION

It is clear to educators now that the lost instructional time during the pandemic is not a one-year fix. It is going to require sustained focus for multiple years to help students get back to grade level work. Unfortunately, the students who were most impacted by the loss of in person learning were the students who were already struggling and underserved before the pandemic.

Millions of dollars of federal funding were awarded to K-12 schools to address students lost instructional time and the current administration has tried to get additional funding passed in Congress. The need for academic intervention to accelerate student learning is a bigger hurdle than most imagined it would be. Our focus needs to be on changing the learning outcomes of our students with effective, research-based intervention, such as high-dosage 1:1 tutoring to close achievement gaps.

In April 2021, a joint memo to the Acting Assistant Secretary of the US Department of Education was sent from a coalition of The Education Trust; Education Reform Now; FutureEd; the Center for American Progress; the Center for Research and Reform in Education at Johns Hopkins University; and the Board of Directors at the Success for All Foundation. This memo urged the department to support states and districts in implementing effective, evidence-based interventions to accelerate learning.

Specifically, they advocated that states set rigorous standards for high-impact tutoring programs that are research and evidence-based and target students most impacted by the pandemic to accelerate student learning toward academic growth.¹



¹ <https://www.future-ed.org/unfinished-instruction-accelerated-learning-and-tutoring/>

WHAT IS HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING?



The Annenberg Institute for School Reform at Brown University defines tutoring as a form of teaching—either one-to-one or in a small group. “High-impact tutoring leads to substantial learning gains for students by supplementing (but not replacing) students’ classroom experiences. High-impact tutoring responds to individual needs and complements students’ existing curriculum.”²

Components of effective high-impact tutoring programs include a specified weekly time commitment, a strong relationship between student and tutor, alignment with the curriculum, progress monitoring of student’s knowledge and skills, and oversight/coaching of tutors to maintain efficacy. For tutoring approaches to be effective, students must spend a substantial amount of time working with their tutor.³ High-dosage tutoring, another name for this type of tutoring, is not remedial work. It focuses on scaffolding content so students can access new learning that is built on their knowledge and skills base.⁴

WHAT IT IS NOT

High-impact tutoring is beneficial for all students and should be treated as a support rather than stand-alone as a remediation tool. Other red flags for tutoring programs that do not qualify as high impact include:

- ✘ Low dosage: it occurs weekly or less than 30 minutes per session; offered as optional, or with higher than a 3:1 student-tutor ratio.
- ✘ Provided by an unqualified tutor: a peer, a high-school volunteer, or untrained tutor.
- ✘ Decontextualized: sitting in front of a computer; focused only on discrete skills or filling out worksheets.
- ✘ Replacement: a substitute for other intensive interventions; in place of classroom instruction; or a cause for students to miss content area classes.⁵

² <https://studentsupportaccelerator.org/about/high-impact-tutoring>

³ Ibid.

⁴ https://osse.dc.gov/sites/default/files/dc/sites/osse/page_content/attachments/HighDosageTutoringGuidance.pdf

⁵ Ibid.

RESEARCH SUPPORTS THE EFFICACY OF HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING



According to research, frequent tutoring is one of the best ways to support students' academic progress. Tutoring has a greater impact on student learning than other factors, such as teacher training, curriculum, extending the school day, or teacher evaluations.⁶

Researchers Carly D. Robinson and Susanna Loeb conducted a meta-analysis of the existing research into high-impact tutoring. They found that research has consistently demonstrated the positive effects that tutoring interventions have on student learning. Although they were not able to link specific program characteristics to student growth, they found that high-impact tutoring programs have the following characteristics:

- ✓ High-dosage—a minimum of three or more sessions per week; 30–60 minutes each.
- ✓ A strong tutor-student relationship.
- ✓ Formative assessments to monitor student learning.
- ✓ Alignment with school curriculum.
- ✓ Formal training and support for tutors.⁷

In an earlier meta-analysis, researchers examined interventions for low socio-economic students in elementary and middle school. Tutoring was singled out as the most common and the most effective intervention for these students, with an average effect size of 0.36-standard deviations on standardized academic tests with a 95 percent confidence interval.⁸

Robinson and Loeb observed that while the effectiveness of individual tutoring programs varies, the academic literature suggests that the drivers of high-impact tutoring are:

⁶ <https://www.edweek.org/leadership/opinion-8-considerations-for-designing-high-impact-tutoring/2021/06>

⁷ https://studentsupportaccelerator.org/sites/default/files/Accelerator_Research_Agenda.pdf

⁸ Ibid.

- 1 Increased instructional time.
- 2 Increased customization/ personalization of learning.
- 3 Improved pedagogy.
- 4 Positive social connection between students and tutors.

Robinson and Loeb determined that tutoring interventions were need-driven and targeted struggling students as they examined the research. They proposed that research be conducted on universal implementations, resulting in reduced social stigma for students receiving tutoring. The research team also noted that tutors with more training in social-emotional learning and cultural competency might be more successful in responding to students' social-emotional needs as they would have a framework for teaching students of all backgrounds.⁹

Most research studies are focused on early grade reading. However, researchers found that tutoring is effective for all grade levels, including middle and high school grades. Evidence is most substantial for reading-focused tutoring for K-2 and math-focused tutoring for older students.

STATES EMBRACE COMPREHENSIVE HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING

[25 states](#) have made provisions for high-impact tutoring for K-12 students with the greatest need to accelerate their learning using ESSER III funds. Most of these states have also introduced or passed legislation to codify these requirements into law.

Results from Texas are typical of implementations in other states.

The Texas legislature codified the need for high-impact tutoring for the state's K-12 students. TX House Bill (HB) 4545 required accelerated instruction for TX students for the 2021-2022 and 2022-2023 school years and following summer for any student in grades 3-8 who did not pass STAAR or End of Class assessments.



⁹ https://studentsupportaccelerator.org/sites/default/files/Accelerator_Research_Agenda.pdf

During the 2021-22 academic year, more than 31,500 students in 52 Texas districts and charter schools participated in tutoring from FEV Tutor. According to NWEA MAP Growth assessments for ELA and math, students who participated in the recommended dosages of online tutoring sessions demonstrated an average of 47% accelerated growth relative to nonparticipants.

The [Texas Impact Report](#) found the number of tutoring sessions impacted learning gains. More than 7,600 students in Texas received math tutoring through FEV Tutor. During the 2021-2022 school year. Students who participated in only six to 10 FEV Tutor sessions improved their scores by 7.60 points on average. In comparison, students who took part in 16-20 sessions and 21-25 sessions improved scores by an average of 8.53 and 9.23 points, respectively.

“More is more,” said Ector County ISD’s Bowie Middle School Principal, Amy Russell. “By delivering ongoing, customized learning plans tied to specific curriculum goals and initiatives via a high-dosage tutoring model, we are seeing dramatic results that are helping our students close their achievement gaps more quickly.”

TEA created several resources for school districts including, training webinars and workshops and a list of approved providers. [The High-Impact Tutoring Toolkit](#) includes a summary of the research, key principles for successful implementation, and program design to implement the program with fidelity. Tutoring studies reveal that the effect of programs conducted during the school day are twice as large as those conducted outside of school.

According to the toolkit, key principles of high-impact tutoring include:

- Well-trained, consistent tutors.
- High-quality instruction material aligned to standards and core classwork.
- One-to-one or small group instruction.
- Embedded during the school day.
- At least three sessions per week.
- Data-driven with tutors building and delivering sessions around student strengths.



FEV TUTOR NATIONAL END OF YEAR RESULTS AY 21-22



More than 25,900 students across 17 states and 56 school districts participated in tutoring with FEV Tutor and took the fall and spring NWEA MAP Growth assessments. FEV Tutor students who were one or more grade levels behind and participated in 21 or more online tutoring sessions achieved 129% of expected growth in ELA and 128% of expected growth in math.

Students achieved similar results on the STAR and iReady tests. FEV Tutor students who were behind grade level and participated in 21 or more online tutoring sessions scored an average of 92.59 points higher in math and 101.69 points higher in math on the STAR tests. On the iReady tests, they grew on average 28.03 points higher in ELA and 24.44 points higher in math from fall to spring.

“The 2021-22 data is consistent with independent analyses conducted over the last several years,” said Vice President of Innovation and Growth for FEV Tutor, Daniel Hebert. “FEV Tutor students see significant improvement in subject mastery and test scores — and the more tutoring they receive, the better they do. This illustrates the critical role that FEV Tutor’s live 1:1 tutoring can play in helping schools address disparities in academic achievement and the effects of disrupted learning during the past several school years.”

EVALUATION THE ROI OF HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING

[Research](#) continues to demonstrate that tutoring interventions have significant positive effects on student learning—particularly post-pandemic as districts invest in programs to accelerate learning. Many districts are using ESSER III funds from the American Rescue Plan to invest in tutoring. They will soon evaluate the results from the programs they’ve put into place to determine if the results justify continued district investment when the ESSER funding runs out in 2024.

The Return on Investment (ROI) for districts will be found in assessment scores throughout the school year, but specifically the end-of-year growth results. The ROI is dependent on the fidelity of implementation of the tutoring program. Did the program meet the district’s goals?



ACADEMIC GROWTH:

The tutoring drove measurable gains for students.



INSTRUCTIONAL CONNECTION:

The tutoring provided 1:1 instruction to each student through various instructional models.



COLLABORATION WITH KEY STAKEHOLDERS:

Teachers and instructional leaders were empowered to collaborate with principals, administrators, curriculum leaders, and others in data-driven instruction.



FAMILY AND STUDENT ENGAGEMENT:

Successfully engaged parents and students to use 1:1 tutoring as a catalyst to increase participation in the core curriculum.

The answer to whether the return on investment is good enough to continue investing in tutoring programs will be found in the district's data. "For FEV Tutor, not only does the data support the efficacy of FEV Tutor, but it also points to a direct and significant correlation between students' level of engagement and their overall level of achievement," said Hebert. "With personalized, engaging tutoring, students who are one or several grade levels below their peers can accelerate their growth, demonstrate gains, and continue on a positive learning trajectory."

CHECKLIST FOR EVALUATING HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING PROGRAMS

Use this list as a guide for evaluating best-in-class tutoring programs for your district.

✓	CUSTOMIZED	Tutoring provider tailors program to the needs of your district.
✓	ESSA COMPLIANT	ESSA research- and evidence-based intervention designed to accelerate learning outcomes for academic gains.
✓	DIGITAL PROMISE CERTIFIED	The tutoring program has been through Digital Promise's rigorous assessment process and determined it qualifies for the Research-Based Design Product Certification.
✓	FREQUENCY	Tutoring occurs in three or more sessions per week.
✓	DATA-DRIVEN	Formative assessments and progress monitoring allow educators to make instructional decisions in real time.
✓	1:1 INSTRUCTION	Live 1:1 online scheduled tutoring sessions that support individualized student needs. Targeted test prep and 24/7 homework help supports flexible learning models.
✓	PERSONNEL	A wide variety of tutors can successfully improve student outcomes if they receive adequate training and support.
✓	FOCUS	Student's individualized personal learning plan aligns with the curriculum, learning standards, and district's instructional goals.
✓	MEASUREMENT	Data use and ongoing informal assessments allow tutors to individualize instruction for each student.
✓	RELATIONSHIPS	Ensuring students have a consistent tutor over time may help facilitate positive student-tutor relationships.
✓	CURRICULUM	High-quality instructional materials aligned to classroom content allows tutors to reinforce and support teachers' instruction.
✓	SCHEDULING	Interventions during the school day yield greater gains than those after-school or during the summer.
✓	DELIVERY MODE	Most research has focused on in-person tutoring, but there is emerging evidence for effective virtual tutoring.
✓	PRIORITIZATION	Target lower-performing students and those students most in need of personalized instruction.

USE FEDERAL FUNDS FOR EVIDENCE-BASED HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING TO ACCELERATE LEARNING



As part of the American Rescue Plan Act (ARPA), Congress required that states and districts designate at least 5 percent and 20 percent of the \$122 billion allocated to K–12 schools to recovery from learning loss.

Significantly, this amount of money totals \$28 billion to spend on unfinished learning across the country. State leaders must ensure that both state and district funds from the ARPA are used for interventions that are evidence-based towards students who were most impacted by unfinished learning during the pandemic. High-impact tutoring [programs are effective](#). Students have gained one to two years of math and one year in English language arts.

Other federal sources of funds include Title I funds, Title II funds for building the teacher pipeline, and Title III funds for English Language Learners are also approved for this purpose.¹⁰

RESULTS FROM HIGH-IMPACT TUTORING: A CASE STUDY

Ector County Independent School District (TX) activated its NWEA MAP Growth data connection with the FEV Tutor platform. Our data analytics team conducted a Fall-to-Spring AY21-22 academic growth analysis comparing RIT Score Growth across various attendance bands of tutoring participation. Leaders at Ector County prioritized incorporating the Design Principles for Effective Tutoring from the Annenberg Institute into their FEV Tutor Foundational Program Design.

FEV Tutor participants demonstrated accelerated growth rates relative to nonparticipants in both Math and Reading. Students who participated in higher dosages of FEV Tutor showed additional gains. Students who participated in recommended dosages of tutoring (FEV Tutor Champions) demonstrated 48% accelerated growth relative to Non- Participants in Math and 107% accelerated growth relative to nonparticipants in Reading.

¹⁰ https://studentsupportaccelerator.org/sites/default/files/Accelerator_Research_Agenda.pdf

ECTOR COUNTY AND FEV TUTOR: BY THE NUMBERS

27

Ector County Public Schools sites using FEV Tutor.

3,500

Ector County Public Schools students served.

50,000

Hours of live 1:1 instruction delivered by FEV Tutor.

21,070

Survey responses, with 80% of submissions rated 5/5 stars.

DIGITAL PROMISE'S CERTIFICATION OF RESEARCH-BASED PRODUCT DESIGN

Educators want and the law requires that districts purchase evidence-based solutions for Math and ELA. Even with “award-winning” products, it is sometimes difficult to tell whether a product has been developed with a rigorous research base. Districts often require that an unbiased third party review the product’s research base to determine efficacy prior to purchase.



[Digital Promise](#) has established a rigorous assessment process to determine whether products have been designed according to learning research. To earn the Research-Based Design Product Certification, FEV Tutor submitted evidence to demonstrate that:

- 1 They consulted rigorous and empirical research and demonstrated their logic model for product design decisions;
- 2 They developed a theoretical framework grounded in research about how people learn to drive product planning and decision making; and
- 3 They publish the product’s research basis in a form the public can easily access.

For an infographic of the detailed FEV Tutor Logic Model, click [here](#).

CONCLUSION

As a result of the pandemic and closed schools, many more students suffer from unfinished learning as a result of remote learning than when schools offer in-person learning. Not surprisingly, the students most impacted are the same students who have been marginalized in the past. This includes low-income, minority, and special education students as well as English learners. High-impact tutoring has shown the greatest impact on these students. However, it is essential to note that students who have unfinished learning come from across the spectrum as a result of the pandemic.

Choosing a tutoring program that has proven effective, is based on rigorous research, aligns with the curriculum, and incorporates best practices for effective 1:1 tutoring is of greater importance now than it ever has been. Students have lost ground during the last 18 months, and the purpose of high-impact tutoring is to get them back to grade level work as quickly as possible.

FEV Tutor is a proven program, certified by Digital Promise, with a mission to make high-quality, online learning options available to all students at all times. FEV Tutor [has been approved](#) for purchase in many states, including Texas where it has been approved as a full-service member of the state's new Vetted Texas Tutoring Corps (VTTC). The TEA vetted all members to ensure that they have the research-based criteria for high-impact tutoring.

FEV Academic Success Coaches (ASC) leverage data, research, and practitioner experience to design a personalized tutoring program that operates as a natural extension of your learning environment. FEV Tutor's ESSA-approved intervention aligns to your school or districts' goals and key objectives to ensure students thrive.

ABOUT FEV TUTOR

FEV Tutor is the pioneer in delivering collaborative, high-impact, live 1:1 online tutoring to K-12 districts that supports individual student needs and drives measurable achievement gains. In partnering with K-12 educators, FEV Tutor provides the industry's most comprehensive virtual tutoring solution to help those students with the greatest needs by aligning its tutoring to the standards, curriculum, goals, and initiatives of each school and district to accelerate learning. The result is a profoundly effective, targeted tutoring program that represents a natural extension of the student's core classroom. To learn how FEV Tutor can support your organization's remote learning efforts, please visit: FEVTutor.com.



REFERENCES

Annenberg Center at Brown University. (2021). *National Student Support Accelerator*.
<https://studentsupportaccelerator.com>

Future Ed, Education Trust, ERN. (2021). *State Guidance for High-Impact Tutoring*.
<https://www.future-ed.org/state-guidance-for-high-impact-tutoring/>

Newman, Kevin. (June 8, 2021). EducationWeek. *8 Considerations for Designing High-Impact Tutoring*.
<https://www.edweek.org/leadership/opinion-8-considerations-for-designing-high-impact-tutoring/2021/06>

Office of the State Superintendent of Education, District of Columbia. (2021). *High-Dosage Tutoring: A Proven Strategy to Accelerate Student Learning*.
https://osse.dc.gov/sites/default/files/dc/sites/osse/page_content/attachments/HighDosageTutoringGuidance.pdf

Robinson, Carly D., and Susanna Loeb. (2021). *High-Impact Tutoring: State of the Research and Priorities for Future Learning*. (EdWorkingPaper: 21-384).
<https://doi.org/10.26300/qf76-rj21>

Robinson, C.D., Kraft, M.A., Loeb, S., & Schueler, B.E. (2021). *Accelerating Student Learning with High-Dosage Tutoring: Ed Research for Recovery Design Principles Series*. Annenberg Institute at Brown University and University of Virginia.
https://annenberg.brown.edu/sites/default/files/EdResearch_for_Recovery_Design_Principles_1.pdf

Texas Education Agency. (2021). *High-Impact Tutoring Toolkit*.
https://tea.texas.gov/sites/default/files/high_impact_tutoring_toolkit.pdf